## Implementations and applications of continuum closures

E. Held J.-Y. Ji M. Sharma A. Spencer E. Barkat.

Utah State University, Department of Physics

#### CEMM at APS-DPP 2009, Atlanta, GA 2009

K ロ ⊁ K 何 ≯ K ヨ ⊁ K ヨ ⊁

 $2Q$ 

<span id="page-0-0"></span>画

### **Outline**



[Solve full plasma kinetic equation using continuum method.](#page-2-0)

- [Apply 2-D finite-elements \(FE\) in Chapman-Enskog-like](#page-2-0) [kinetic equation.](#page-2-0)
- [Slowing down of diffuse ion beam.](#page-4-0)
- 2 [Solve drift kinetic equation using continuum method.](#page-10-0)
	- [Recap of recursive drift kinetic theory.](#page-10-0)
	- [Application to sound wave damping problem.](#page-12-0)
	- [One recursion introduces drift effects.](#page-17-0)

④ → ④ ⇒ ④ ⇒

 $($  ロ )  $($   $\theta$  )  $($   $\theta$   $)$   $($   $\theta$   $)$   $($   $\theta$   $)$ 

<span id="page-2-0"></span> $2Q$ 

#### Solve Chapman-Enskog-like (CEL) kinetic equation.

● Couple solutions of 6-D, time-dependent Chapman-Enskog-like kinetic equation to evolving fluid equations through closures for **q**and Π:  $\frac{\partial F}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla F + \mathbf{a} \cdot \nabla F = C(F + f_M) - \frac{m}{T}$  $\frac{m}{T}$  $(v'$ **v**′ −  $v'^2$  $\frac{1}{3}$  $):$  $\nabla$ **u**− 2*fm* 3*p L* (3/2)  $\frac{1}{1}$ <sup>(3/2)</sup> [ $\nabla \cdot \mathbf{q} + \mathbf{\Pi}$ : $\nabla \mathbf{V} - \mathbf{Q}$ ] +  $\mathbf{v}'\cdot\left[\frac{f_m}{\rho}\left(\nabla\cdot\mathbf{\Pi}-\mathbf{R}\right)+\frac{f_m}{\mathcal{T}}\mathsf{L}_1^{(5/2)}\nabla\mathcal{T}\right]$ where  $f_M = n(\mathbf{x},t) \left( \frac{m}{2\pi T G} \right)$  $\left(\frac{m}{2\pi T(\mathbf{x},T)}\right)^{3/2}e^{-\frac{m(\mathbf{v}-\mathbf{u})^2}{2T}}$ 2*T* and  $\mathbf{v} = v_{\parallel} \mathbf{b} + v_{\perp} (\mathbf{e}_2 \sin \gamma - \mathbf{e}_3 \cos \gamma).$ 

[Apply 2-D finite-elements \(FE\) in Chapman-Enskog-like kinetic equa](#page-2-0)tion. [Slowing down of diffuse ion beam.](#page-4-0)

#### Use 2-D FE, 1-D Fourier basis for F.

- Expand distribution function as  $\mathcal{F} = \mathcal{F}_0 + \sum_{n>0} \mathcal{F}_n e^{in\gamma} + \mathcal{F}_n^{\dagger} e^{-in\gamma},$ with Fourier coefficients expanded as  $\mathcal{F}_n = \sum_j \mathcal{F}_{nj}(\mathbf{x},t) \alpha_j(\mathbf{v}_{\perp},\mathbf{v}_{\parallel}).$
- At present, test particle portion of linearized Coulomb collision operator is implemented.
	- $\int d\textbf{v}$ α $\mathcal{C}(f_\alpha, f_{\textit{M}\beta}) =$  $-\frac{2\pi q_\alpha^2 q_\beta^2 ln\Lambda_{ab}}{m^2}$ *m*<sup>2</sup> α *n*β *n*α 1  $\frac{1}{z_{\beta}}\int d$ **v**(4 $\frac{m_{\alpha}}{m_{\beta}}$ *m*<sup>β</sup> 1  $\frac{1}{\mathsf{v}_{\mathsf{T}\beta}}\mathsf{G}(\mathsf{z}_\beta\cdot \frac{\partial\alpha}{\partial\mathsf{v}})$  $\frac{\partial \alpha}{\partial \mathbf{v}}$ )  $f_\alpha +$  $(E-G)(\frac{\partial \alpha}{\partial \mathbf{v}} \cdot \frac{\partial f_{\alpha}}{\partial \mathbf{v}}) + (\frac{3G-E}{z_{\beta}^2})(\mathbf{z}_{\beta} \cdot \frac{\partial \alpha}{\partial \mathbf{v}})$  $\frac{\partial \alpha}{\partial \mathbf{v}}$  ) $(\mathbf{z}_{\beta} \cdot \frac{\partial f_{\alpha}}{\partial \mathbf{v}}))$ .

K ロ ⊁ K 個 ≯ K 君 ⊁ K 君 ⊁

画

[Apply 2-D finite-elements \(FE\) in Chapman-Enskog-like kinetic equa](#page-2-0)tion. [Slowing down of diffuse ion beam.](#page-4-0)

#### Apply test-particle operator to beam ions.



E. Held, J.-Y. Ji, M. Sharma, A. Spencer, E. Barkat. [Implementations and applications of continuum closures](#page-0-0)

4 €

4 0 8

<span id="page-4-0"></span> $290$ 

[Apply 2-D finite-elements \(FE\) in Chapman-Enskog-like kinetic equa](#page-2-0)tion. [Slowing down of diffuse ion beam.](#page-4-0)

#### After 1 collision time.



(ロ) (伊)

 $290$ 

[Apply 2-D finite-elements \(FE\) in Chapman-Enskog-like kinetic equa](#page-2-0)tion. [Slowing down of diffuse ion beam.](#page-4-0)

#### After 3 collision times.



€

(ロ) (伊)

 $2Q$ 

G

[Apply 2-D finite-elements \(FE\) in Chapman-Enskog-like kinetic equa](#page-2-0)tion. [Slowing down of diffuse ion beam.](#page-4-0)

(ロ) (伊)

 $2Q$ 

ă

#### After 5 collision times.



[Apply 2-D finite-elements \(FE\) in Chapman-Enskog-like kinetic equa](#page-2-0)tion. [Slowing down of diffuse ion beam.](#page-4-0)

#### After 20 collision times distribution is Maxwellian.



 $\leftarrow$   $\leftarrow$   $\rightarrow$ 

4 0 8

[Apply 2-D finite-elements \(FE\) in Chapman-Enskog-like kinetic equa](#page-2-0)tion. [Slowing down of diffuse ion beam.](#page-4-0)

イロメ イ何 メイヨメ イヨメ

 $2Q$ 

#### Future work on full continuum solution.

- Test-particle operator implemented.
- Implement field terms of linearized Coulomb operator.
- **•** Implement nonlinear terms.
- Develop coding necessary to extend solution to spatial domain.

[Recap of recursive drift kinetic theory.](#page-10-0) [Application to sound wave damping problem.](#page-12-0) [One recursion introduces drift effects.](#page-17-0)

イロメ イ伊 ドイヨメ イヨメー

<span id="page-10-0"></span> $2Q$ 

# Drift kinetic theory a la Hazeltine '73.

- Define  $L = d/dt \Omega \partial/\partial \gamma$ , total time derivative without the rapid gyro-motion. HereΩ = *qB*/*m*.
- Hazeltine suggests solving  $\Omega \frac{\partial \tilde{f}}{\partial \gamma} = - (L-C) f + \langle (L-C) f \rangle,$ by approximating f on right as  $\bar{f}$  (the gyro-angle

independent part).

- Can repeat this by step by using  $f = \overline{f} + \tilde{f}_1$  on right to get an improved *f*.
- **•** Finally, insert  $f = \overline{f} + \tilde{f}_i$  after *j* recursions into  $\langle (L C)f \rangle = 0$ and solve for ¯*f*.

[Recap of recursive drift kinetic theory.](#page-10-0) [Application to sound wave damping problem.](#page-12-0) [One recursion introduces drift effects.](#page-17-0)

# Zero recursions  $(f = 0)$  leads to lowest-order CEL-drift kinetic equation.

• Solve lowest-order equation for electrons and ions to compute parallel closures, **q**||and **˝**||:

 $\frac{\partial F}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v}_{||} \cdot \nabla F + \frac{q}{n}$  $\frac{q}{m}E_{\parallel}\frac{v_{\parallel}}{v}$ *v* ∂*F* <sup>∂</sup>*<sup>v</sup>* =  $\langle C(F+f_M)\rangle-\frac{mv^2}{\mathcal{T}}f_M(\mathbf{bb}-\frac{1}{3})$ <u><sup>1</sup></u>):∇u−

$$
+\frac{2f_m}{3p}L_1^{(3/2)}\left[\nabla\cdot\mathbf{q}+\mathbf{\Pi}:\nabla\mathbf{V}-\mathbf{Q}-\mathbf{S}_0^{rf}\right]+
$$

 $\mathbf{v}_{||}\cdot\left[\frac{f_m}{\rho}\left(\nabla\cdot\mathbf{\Pi}-\mathbf{R}-F_0^{\prime f}\right)+\frac{f_m}{T}L_1^{(5/2)}\nabla\mathcal{T}\right]$ 

Expand  $F = \sum_{l=0}^{nl} F_l(\mathbf{x}, t, s) P_l(v_{||}/v)$ , where the coefficients *Fl*(**x**, *t*, *s*) are determined on a grid of *ns* grid points in the normalized speed,  $s = v/v<sub>T</sub>$  $s = v/v<sub>T</sub>$  $s = v/v<sub>T</sub>$ [.](#page-12-0)

 $4$  ロ }  $4$   $6$  }  $4$   $\geq$  }  $4$   $\geq$  }

<span id="page-12-0"></span> $2Q$ 

#### Time-discretization and centering issues.

- Present implementation centers *Fe*and *Fi*with *n*, **B**, *Te*, *T<sup>i</sup>* in time.
- *n*, **B**, *Te*and *Ti*dependence in Maxwellian drives approximately centered in implicit *F* advance.
- Advance **V**, *n*, *Fe*,*F<sup>i</sup>* , compute closures.
- Advance *Te*,*Ti*and **B**, solve again for *Fe*,*F<sup>i</sup>* with approximately centered *n*, **B**, *Te*, *T<sup>i</sup>* , and recompute closures.
- Advance *Te*,*Ti*and **B**with approximately centered closures.

[Recap of recursive drift kinetic theory.](#page-10-0) [Application to sound wave damping problem.](#page-12-0) [One recursion introduces drift effects.](#page-17-0)

Apply to sound wave damping problem.

**•** Test stress damping of sound waves with adiabatic equation of state.



4 0 8

[Recap of recursive drift kinetic theory.](#page-10-0) [Application to sound wave damping problem.](#page-12-0) [One recursion introduces drift effects.](#page-17-0)

#### Test convergence in velocity space.

- $\bullet$  Number of Legendre polynomials = nl. Number of grid points in speed = ns.
- 2 Limits on workstation with 4 GB of memory: nl=12 and  $ns=4$ .



E. Held, J.-Y. Ji, M. Sharma, A. Spencer, E. Barkat. [Implementations and applications of continuum closures](#page-0-0)

4 0 8

[Recap of recursive drift kinetic theory.](#page-10-0) [Application to sound wave damping problem.](#page-12-0) [One recursion introduces drift effects.](#page-17-0)

イロメ イ何 メイヨメ イヨメ

 $2Q$ 

Future work on lowest-order continuum solution to CEL-DKE.

- Implement RF quasilinear source terms imported from GENRAY.
- Implement finite flow corrections in Maxwellian drives.
- Implement calculation of self-consistent, equilibrium*Fe*and *Fi* (needed when there is equilibrium current and flow).
- **•** Test continuum solution to CEL-DKE on various problems.

[Recap of recursive drift kinetic theory.](#page-10-0) [Application to sound wave damping problem.](#page-12-0) [One recursion introduces drift effects.](#page-17-0)

K ロ ⊁ K 何 ⊁ K ヨ ⊁ K ヨ

 $\Omega$ 

#### Compare with Chang/Callen '92.

- One-pole approximations for linear closures were given as:  $\mathsf{b}\cdot \nabla \cdot \tilde{\mathsf{\Pi}} \approx n_0 m_i \frac{3}{5}$  $\frac{3}{5}$   $\left[\sqrt{\pi}k_{\parallel}V_{Ti} - \frac{6}{5}\right]$  $\frac{6}{5}(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} + 0.32 \nu_{ii})\big]\, \tilde{\pmb{\nu}}_{||i}$  $+\frac{2}{5}$ 5  $\left[ k_{\parallel}v_{7i} - \sqrt{\frac{3\pi}{10}}(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} + 0.42\nu_{ii}) \right] \frac{n_0}{k_{\parallel}v}$  $\frac{n_0}{k_{||}V_{Ti}}(\nabla_{{||}}^{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}\boldsymbol{T})$  $\widetilde{q}_{\parallel}\approx\frac{2}{5}$ 5  $\left[ k_{\parallel}v_{\overline{I}} - \sqrt{\frac{3\pi}{10}}(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} + 0.42\nu_{ii}) \right] \frac{\rho_{ii}}{k_{\parallel}v_{\parallel}}$  $\frac{p_i}{k_{||} v_{\mathcal{T}i}} \tilde{\mathcal{U}}_{||i}$  $-\frac{9}{5\pi}\left[\sqrt{\pi}k_{\parallel}\nu_{Ti}-\frac{72}{25\pi}(\frac{\partial}{\partial t}+0.42\nu_{ii})\right]\frac{I_{00}^2}{k_{\perp}^2}$  $\frac{n_0}{k_\parallel^2}(\nabla_\parallel\tilde{\bm{\mathsf{T}}})$
- Compare linear damping results between theory, kinetic MHD and continuum closure calculations.

[Recap of recursive drift kinetic theory.](#page-10-0) [Application to sound wave damping problem.](#page-12-0) [One recursion introduces drift effects.](#page-17-0)

**K ロ ト K 何 ト K ヨ ト K ヨ** 

<span id="page-17-0"></span> $\Omega$ 

#### Drift corrections needed for many problems.

• Do one level of recursive theory to incorporate drift effects.

• Integrate, 
$$
\Omega \frac{\partial \tilde{f}_1}{\partial \gamma} = -(L - C)\overline{f} + \langle (L - C)\overline{f} \rangle
$$
.

- **•** Insert  $f = \overline{f} + \tilde{f}$ <sub>1</sub> into  $\langle (L C)f \rangle = 0$  and solve for  $\overline{f}$ .
- $S$ olve: $\frac{\partial \bar{F}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{v}_{||} + \mathbf{v}_{D}) \cdot \nabla \bar{F} + a \frac{\partial \bar{F}}{\partial \epsilon} =$  Maxwellian drives including drift effects.